

**STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT
OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE & INSPECTION**

IN RE: Yonatan Mabat

**FILE NOS.: FW-12-147 and
C12-0127**

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

A. Introduction

Pursuant to Sections 42-17.1-2(21) and 42-17.6-3 of the Rhode Island General Laws, as amended, (“R.I. Gen. Laws”) you are hereby notified that the Director of the Department of Environmental Management (the “Director” of “DEM”) has reasonable grounds to believe that the above-named party (“Respondent”) has violated certain statutes and/or administrative regulations under DEM's jurisdiction.

B. Administrative History

On 19 October 2012 the DEM issued an informal written notice to the Respondent for the violation. The notice required specific actions to correct the violation. The Respondent received the notice on 13 December 2012 and submitted a letter to the DEM that was received on 27 December 2012 stating his intention to comply with the notice. On 26 April 2013 the DEM inspector met with the Respondent on the property and explained what was required to comply with the notice. The Respondent stated that he would comply; however, to date, he has failed to do so.

C. Facts

- (1) The property is located immediately east of Quaker Lane, approximately 580 feet south-southeast of the intersection of Centerville Road (Route 117) and Quaker Lane, Assessor's Plat 241, Lot 33 in the city of Warwick, Rhode Island (the “Property”).
- (2) The Respondent owns the Property.
- (3) The DEM inspected the Property on 1 October 2012, 20 November 2012, 26 April 2013, and 14 January 2014. The inspections revealed the following:
 - (a) Clearing in a Swamp, portions of which include 200 foot Riverbank Wetland associated with Hardig Brook (the “Riverbank Wetland”) and Flood Plain. These activities resulted in the unauthorized alteration of approximately 8000 square feet of freshwater wetland.
 - (b) Filling (in the form of soil material, crushed stone, and tree and shrub debris), clearing, grading, and creating soil disturbance within the Riverbank Wetland, portions of which include 50 foot Perimeter Wetland

associated with the Swamp (the “Perimeter Wetland”) and Flood Plain. These activities resulted in the unauthorized alteration of approximately 1000 square feet of freshwater wetland.

- (4) The Respondent did not receive approval from the DEM to alter freshwater wetlands on the Property.

D. Violation

Based on the foregoing facts, the Director has reasonable grounds to believe that you have violated the following statutes and/or regulations:

- (1) **R.I. Gen. Laws Section 2-1-21** – prohibiting activities which may alter freshwater wetlands without a permit from the DEM.
- (2) **DEM’s Rules and Regulations Governing the Administration and Enforcement of the Freshwater Wetlands Act, Rule 5.01** – prohibiting activities which may alter freshwater wetlands without a permit from the DEM.

E. Order

Based upon the violations alleged above and pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.1-2(21), you are hereby ORDERED to:

- (1) **IMMEDIATELY** cease and desist from any further alteration of the above described freshwater wetlands.
- (2) Restore all freshwater wetlands in accordance with the restoration requirements set forth below.

RESTORATION REQUIREMENTS

- (a) Prior to the commencement of restoration, install a continuous uninterrupted line of staked haybales or silt fence along the edge of the unauthorized fill and the adjacent undisturbed freshwater wetlands. The soil erosion and sediment controls must be regularly inspected and properly and continually maintained (and replaced) during and following the completion of the required wetland restoration activities, and until such time that all surrounding areas are properly stabilized. At the discretion and direction of the DEM, additional soil erosion and sediment controls must be installed on-site, as deemed necessary, to protect any and all freshwater wetlands.
- (b) Remove all unauthorized fill material (in the form of at least soil material, crushed stone, and tree waste) from the freshwater wetlands. All fill material that is removed must be deposited in an appropriate upland location, outside of all wetlands.

- (c) Plant all unauthorized cleared and altered areas within the Perimeter Wetland and the Riverbank Wetland with trees and shrubs.

Balled and burlapped or transplanted tree species must be planted in an interspersed fashion, 10 feet on center, 4 feet tall after planting, throughout the disturbed area described above. Tree species must include an equal distribution of at least 3 of the following selections:

White pine, *Pinus strobus*
Red Spruce, *Picea rubens*
Red cedar, *Juniperus virginiana*
Red maple, *Acer rubrum*
Northern red oak, *Quercus rubra*
White oak, *Quercus alba*
Pin oak, *Quercus palustris*
Gray Birch, *Betula populifolia*

Balled and burlapped or transplanted shrub species must be planted in an interspersed fashion, 5 feet on center, 3 feet tall after planting, throughout the disturbed area described above. Shrub species must include an equal distribution of at least 3 of the following selections:

Mountain laurel, *Kalmia latifolia*
Giant rhododendron, *Rhododendron maximum*
Arrowwood, *Viburnum dentatum*
Wild raisin, *Viburnum cassinoides*
Winterberry, *Ilex verticillata*
Inkberry, *Ilex glabra*
Highbush blueberry, *Vaccinium corymbosum*
Witchhazel, *Hamamelis virginiana*

- (d) If any or all of the required plantings fail to survive at least 1 full year from the time the plantings have been verified by the DEM, the same plant species shall be replanted and maintained until such time that survival occurs over 1 full year.
- (e) All disturbed surfaces outside of the Swamp must be seeded with a wildlife conservation grass seed mixture and stabilized with a mat of loose hay mulch.
- (f) All restored wetland areas, including replanted areas, shall be allowed to revegetate naturally and revert to a natural wild state. No future clearing, mowing, cutting, trimming, or other alterations are allowed in the restored wetland areas, or within other freshwater wetlands on the Property, without first obtaining a permit from the DEM.

- (g) Upon stabilization of all disturbed areas all artificial erosion and sedimentation controls (e.g., silt fences and silt curtains) shall be removed from the freshwater wetland. Staked haybales, spread hay mulch, and other naturally-based/bio-degradable erosion control measures may remain in place to decompose naturally. Prior to the removal of the controls all accumulated sediment shall be removed to a suitable upland area and all disturbed surfaces shall be stabilized as described above.
 - (h) The above restoration work shall be completed prior to **31 October 2014**.
- (3) Contact Ms. Shawna Smith at (401) 222-4700 ext. 7427 prior to the commencement of restoration to ensure proper supervision and to obtain required restoration details. No work shall commence until such time that you have met on the Property with the DEM.

F. Penalty

- (1) Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.6-2, the following administrative penalty, as more specifically described in the attached penalty summary and worksheets, is hereby ASSESSED, jointly and severally, against each named respondent:

Two Thousand Dollars (\$2,000.00)

- (2) The proposed administrative penalty is calculated pursuant to the DEM's *Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties*, as amended, and must be paid to the DEM within 30 days of your receipt of this NOV. Payment shall be in the form of a certified check, cashiers check or money order made payable to the "General Treasury - Water & Air Protection Program Account" and shall be forwarded to the DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection, 235 Promenade Street, Suite 220, Providence, Rhode Island 02908-5767.
- (3) Penalties assessed against the Respondent in this NOV are penalties payable to and for the benefit of the State of Rhode Island and are not compensation for actual pecuniary loss.

G. Right to Administrative Hearing

- (1) Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Chapters 42-17.1, 42-17.6, 42-17.7 and 42-35, each named respondent is entitled to request a hearing before the DEM Administrative Adjudication Division regarding the allegations, orders and/or penalties set forth in Sections B through F above. All requests for hearing MUST:
- (a) Be in writing. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and 42-17.6-4(b);

- (b) Be **RECEIVED** by the DEM's Administrative Adjudication Division, at the following address, within 20 days of your receipt of this NOV. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and 42-17.7-9:

Administrative Clerk
DEM - Administrative Adjudication Division
One Capitol Hill, 2ND Floor
Providence, RI 02903

- (c) Indicate whether you deny the alleged violations and/or whether you believe that the administrative penalty is excessive. See R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.6-4(b); **AND**
- (d) State clearly and concisely the specific issues which are in dispute, the facts in support thereof and the relief sought or involved, if any. See Rule 7.00(b) of the DEM's *Administrative Rules of Practice and Procedure for the Administrative Adjudication Division of Environmental Matters*.
- (2) A copy of each request for hearing must also be forwarded to:

Joseph J. LoBianco, Esquire
DEM - Office of Legal Services
235 Promenade Street, 4TH Floor
Providence, RI 02908-5767

- (3) Each named respondent has the right to be represented by legal counsel at all administrative proceedings relating to this matter.
- (4) Each respondent must file a separate and timely request for an administrative hearing before the DEM's Administrative Adjudication Division as to each violation alleged in the written NOV. If any respondent fails to request a hearing in the above-described time or manner with regard to any violation set forth herein, then this NOV shall automatically become a Final Compliance Order enforceable in Superior Court as to that respondent and/or violation and any associated administrative penalty proposed in the NOV shall be final as to that respondent. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and (v) and 42-17.6-4(b) and (c).
- (5) Failure to comply with this NOV may subject each respondent to additional civil and/or criminal penalties.
- (6) An original signed copy of this NOV is being forwarded to the city of Warwick wherein the Property is located to be recorded in the Office of Land Evidence Records pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Chapter 34-13 and 2-1-24, as amended.
- (7) This NOV does not preclude the Director from taking any additional enforcement action nor does it preclude any other local, state, or federal governmental entities

from initiating enforcement actions based on the acts or omissions described herein.

If you have any legal questions, you may contact (or if you are represented by an attorney, please have your attorney contact) Joseph J. LoBianco at the DEM Office of Legal Services at (401) 222-6607. All other inquiries should be directed to Ms. Shawna Smith or Mr. Harold Ellis of the DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection at (401) 222-4700 extensions 7427 and 7401, respectively.

Please be advised that any such inquiries do not postpone, eliminate, or otherwise extend the need for a timely submittal of a written request for a hearing, as described in Section G above.

FOR THE DIRECTOR

David E. Chopy, Chief
DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection

Date: _____

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that on the _____ day of _____
the within Notice of Violation was forwarded to:

Yonatan Mabat
14 Lakewood Street
Providence, RI 02906

by Certified Mail.



ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY SUMMARY

Program: OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE AND INSPECTION, WETLANDS
 File No.: FW C12-0127
 Respondent: Yonatan Mabat

GRAVITY OF VIOLATION					
SEE ATTACHED "PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEETS."					
VIOLATION No. & CITATION	APPLICATION OF MATRIX		PENALTY CALCULATION		AMOUNT
	Type	Deviation	Penalty from Matrix	Number or Duration of Violations	
D(1) and D(2) – Alteration of a Swamp, Riverbank Wetland, and Floodplain without a permit	Type I (\$5,000 Max. Penalty)*	Moderate	\$1,250	1 violation	\$1,250.00
D(1) and D(2) – Alteration of a Perimeter Wetland, Riverbank Wetland, and Floodplain without a permit	Type I (\$5,000 Max. Penalty)*	Minor	\$750	1 violation	\$750.00
SUB-TOTAL					\$2,000.00

*Maximum Penalties represent the maximum penalty amounts per day, per violation.

ECONOMIC BENEFIT FROM NONCOMPLIANCE
<p>COSTS OF COMPLIANCE, EQUIPMENT, O&M, STUDIES OR OTHER DELAYED OR AVOIDED COSTS, INCLUDING INTEREST AND/OR ANY COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE DERIVED OVER ENTITIES THAT ARE IN COMPLIANCE. NOTE: ECONOMIC BENEFIT MUST BE INCLUDED IN THE PENALTY UNLESS:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - THERE IS NO IDENTIFIABLE BENEFIT FROM NONCOMPLIANCE; OR - THE AMOUNT OF ECONOMIC BENEFIT CAN NOT BE QUANTIFIED.
<p>A review of the record in this matter has revealed that the Respondent has either enjoyed no identifiable benefit from the noncompliance alleged in this enforcement action or that the amount of economic benefit that may have resulted can not be quantified.</p>

COST RECOVERY
<p>ADDITIONAL OR EXTRAORDINARY COSTS INCURRED BY THE DIRECTOR DURING THE INVESTIGATION, ENFORCEMENT AND RESOLUTION OF AN ENFORCEMENT ACTION (EXCLUDING NON-OVERTIME PERSONNEL COSTS), FOR WHICH THE STATE IS NOT OTHERWISE REIMBURSED.</p>
<p>A review of the record in this matter has revealed that the DEM has not incurred any additional or extraordinary costs during the investigation, enforcement and resolution of this enforcement action (excluding non-overtime personnel costs), for which the State is not otherwise reimbursed.</p>

TOTAL PENALTY PROPOSED UNDER PENALTY REGULATIONS = \$2,000.00

PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEET

CITATION: Alteration of a Swamp, Riverbank Wetland, and Floodplain
 VIOLATION NO.: D (1) and (2)

TYPE		
<p><u> X </u> TYPE I <u>DIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>	<p><u> </u> TYPE II <u>INDIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>	<p><u> </u> TYPE III <u>INCIDENTAL</u> to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>
DEVIATION FROM THE STANDARD <small>THE DEGREE TO WHICH A PARTICULAR VIOLATION IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT VIOLATED.</small>		
<p><u>FACTORS CONSIDERED:</u></p> <p>Taken from Section 10 (a) (2) of the DEM <i>Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties</i></p> <p>(A) The extent to which the act or failure to act was out of compliance: The Respondent altered freshwater wetlands by clearing in a Swamp, portions of which include Riverbank Wetland and Flood Plain. The severity of the alteration to the wetland environment was determined to be of importance to the regulatory program.</p> <p>(B) Environmental conditions: The Swamp, Riverbank Wetland, and Floodplain were previously undisturbed forest prior to the unauthorized alteration.</p> <p>(C) Amount of the pollutant: Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(D) Toxicity or nature of the pollutant: Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(E) Duration of the violation: Unknown. At least 1 ½ years. The DEM first documented the violation on 1 October 2012.</p> <p>(F) Areal extent of the violation: About 8000 square feet.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">(continued)</p>		

(continued from the previous page)

- (G) **Whether the person took reasonable and appropriate steps to prevent and/or mitigate the noncompliance:** The Respondent failed to obtain the appropriate permit from the DEM.
- (H) **Whether the person has previously failed to comply with any regulations, order, statute, license, permit or approval issued or adopted by the Department, or any law which the Department has the authority or responsibility to enforce:** Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.
- (I) **The degree of willfulness or negligence, including but not limited to, how much control the violator had over the occurrence of the violation and whether the violation was foreseeable:** The Respondent had complete control over the project and had an obligation to protect the wetlands on the property.
- (J) **Any other factor(s) that may be relevant in determining the amount of a penalty:** Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.

MAJOR	<u>X</u> MODERATE	MINOR
--------------	--------------------------	--------------

Penalty Matrix where the applicable statute provides for a civil penalty up to \$ 5,000		TYPE I	TYPE II	TYPE III
DEVIATION FROM STANDARD	MAJOR	\$2,500 to \$5,000	\$1,250 to \$2,500	\$500 to \$1,250
	MODERATE	\$1,250 to \$2,500 \$1250	\$500 to \$1,250	\$250 to \$500
	MINOR	\$500 to \$1,250	\$250 to \$500	\$100 to \$250

PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEET

CITATION: Alteration of Perimeter Wetland, Riverbank Wetland, and Floodplain
 VIOLATION NO.: D (1) and (2)

TYPE		
<p><u> X </u> TYPE I <u>DIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>	<p><u> </u> TYPE II <u>INDIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>	<p><u> </u> TYPE III <u>INCIDENTAL</u> to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>
DEVIATION FROM THE STANDARD		
<small>THE DEGREE TO WHICH A PARTICULAR VIOLATION IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT VIOLATED.</small>		
<p>FACTORS CONSIDERED: Taken from Section 10 (a) (2) of the DEM <i>Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties</i></p> <p>(A) The extent to which the act or failure to act was out of compliance: The Respondent altered freshwater wetlands by filling (in the form of soil material, crushed stone, and tree and shrub debris), clearing, grading, and creating soil disturbance within Riverbank Wetland, portions of which include Perimeter Wetland and Flood Plain. The severity of the alteration to the wetland environment was determined to be of importance to the regulatory program.</p> <p>(B) Environmental conditions: The Perimeter Wetland, Riverbank Wetland, and Floodplain were previously undisturbed forest prior to the unauthorized alteration. The fill has displaced flood storage along the River (Hardig Brook).</p> <p>(C) Amount of the pollutant: Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(D) Toxicity or nature of the pollutant: Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(E) Duration of the violation: Unknown. At least 1 ½ years. The DEM first documented the violation on 1 October 2012.</p> <p>(F) Areal extent of the violation: About 1000 square feet.</p>		
(continued)		

(continued from the previous page)

- (G) **Whether the person took reasonable and appropriate steps to prevent and/or mitigate the noncompliance:** The Respondent failed to obtain the appropriate permit from DEM.
- (H) **Whether the person has previously failed to comply with any regulations, order, statute, license, permit or approval issued or adopted by the Department, or any law which the Department has the authority or responsibility to enforce:** Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.
- (I) **The degree of willfulness or negligence, including but not limited to, how much control the violator had over the occurrence of the violation and whether the violation was foreseeable:** The Respondent had complete control over the project and had an obligation to protect the wetlands on the property.
- (J) **Any other factor(s) that may be relevant in determining the amount of a penalty:** Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.

MAJOR	MODERATE	<u>X</u> MINOR
--------------	-----------------	------------------------------

Penalty Matrix where the applicable statute provides for a civil penalty up to \$ 5,000		TYPE I	TYPE II	TYPE III
DEVIATION FROM STANDARD	MAJOR	\$2,500 to \$5,000	\$1,250 to \$2,500	\$500 to \$1,250
	MODERATE	\$1,250 to \$2,500	\$500 to \$1,250	\$250 to \$500
	MINOR	\$500 to \$1,250 \$750	\$250 to \$500	\$100 to \$250