

**STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT**

OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE & INSPECTION

IN RE: Dominion Energy Manchester Street, Inc.

FILE NO.: AIR 13 – 06

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

A. Introduction

Pursuant to Sections 42-17.1-2(21) and 42-17.6-3 of the Rhode Island General Laws, as amended, (“R.I. Gen. Laws”) you are hereby notified that the Director of the Department of Environmental Management (the “Director” of “DEM”) has reasonable grounds to believe that the above-named party (“Respondent”) has violated certain statutes and/or administrative regulations under DEM's jurisdiction.

B. Facts

- (1) The subject facility is located at 40 Point Street in the city of Providence, Rhode Island (the “Facility”) and is operated by the Respondent.
- (2) The Facility is a stationary source of air pollutants subject to the DEM’s Air Pollution Control (“APC”) Regulations.
- (3) On 26 June 2007, the DEM issued Operating Permit No. RI-22-07 (R1) to the Respondent (the “Permit”). The Permit was revised on 31 July 2009.
- (4) The Permit requires a nitrogen oxides (NO_x) emission rate of 300 pounds NO_x per hour or less during start up of Combustion Turbine Unit No. 9 (the “Turbine”).
- (5) On 30 January 2013, DEM received correspondence from the Respondent. The correspondence revealed that on 23 January 2013 the hourly nitrogen oxides emission rate during start up of the Turbine was 398.6 pounds NO_x per hour for one hour.

C. Violation

Based on the foregoing facts, the Director has reasonable grounds to believe that you have violated the following statutes and/or regulations:

- (1) **DEM’s APC Regulation 29.4.6** – requiring compliance with an operating permit.

D. Penalty

- (1) Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.6-2, the following administrative penalty, as more specifically described in the attached penalty summary and

worksheets, is hereby ASSESSED, jointly and severally, against each named respondent:

One Thousand Dollars (\$1,000.00)

- (2) The proposed administrative penalty is calculated pursuant to the DEM's *Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties*, as amended, and must be paid to the DEM within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this Notice of Violation ("NOV"). Payment shall be in the form of a certified check, cashiers check or money order made payable to the "General Treasury - Water & Air Protection Program Account," and shall be forwarded to the DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection, 235 Promenade Street, Suite 220, Providence, Rhode Island 02908-5767.
- (3) Penalties assessed against the Respondent in this NOV are penalties payable to and for the benefit of the State of Rhode Island and are not compensation for actual pecuniary loss.

E. Right to Administrative Hearing

- (1) Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Chapters 42-17.1, 42-17.6, 42-17.7 and 42-35, each named respondent is entitled to request a hearing before the DEM Administrative Adjudication Division regarding the allegations, orders and/or penalties set forth in Sections B through E above. All requests for hearing MUST:
 - (a) Be in writing. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and 42-17.6-4(b);
 - (b) Be **RECEIVED** by DEM's Administrative Adjudication Division, at the following address, within thirty (30) days of your receipt of this NOV. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and 42-17.7-9:

Administrative Clerk
DEM - Administrative Adjudication Division
One Capitol Hill, 2ND Floor
Providence, RI 02903

- (c) Indicate whether you deny the alleged violations and/or whether you believe that the administrative penalty is excessive. See R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.6-4(b); **AND**
- (d) State clearly and concisely the specific issues which are in dispute, the facts in support thereof and the relief sought or involved, if any. See Rule 7.00(b) of the DEM Administrative Rules of Practice and Procedure for the Administrative Adjudication Division of Environmental Matters.

- (2) A copy of each request for hearing must also be forwarded to:

Joseph J. LoBianco, Esquire
DEM - Office of Legal Services
235 Promenade Street, 4TH Floor
Providence, RI 02908-5767

- (3) Each named respondent has the right to be represented by legal counsel at all administrative proceedings relating to this matter.
- (4) Each respondent must file a separate and timely request for an administrative hearing before DEM's Administrative Adjudication Division as to each violation alleged in the written NOV. If any respondent fails to request a hearing in the above-described time or manner with regard to any violation set forth herein, then this NOV shall automatically become a Final Compliance Order enforceable in Superior Court as to that respondent and/or violation and any associated administrative penalty proposed in the NOV shall be final as to that respondent. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and (v) and 42-17.6-4(b) and (c).
- (5) Failure to comply with this NOV may subject each respondent to additional civil and/or criminal penalties.
- (6) This NOV does not preclude the Director from taking any additional enforcement action nor does it preclude any other local, state, or federal governmental entities from initiating enforcement actions based on the acts or omissions described herein.

If you have any legal questions, you may contact (or if you are represented by an attorney, please have your attorney contact) Joseph J. LoBianco at the DEM Office of Legal Services at (401) 222-6607. All other inquiries should be directed to Martha Mulcahey of DEM's Office of Compliance and Inspection at (401) 222-1360 ext. 7032.

Please be advised that any such inquiries do not postpone, eliminate, or otherwise extend the need for a timely submittal of a written request for a hearing, as described in Section E above.

FOR THE DIRECTOR

David E. Chopy, Chief
DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection

Date: _____

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that on the _____ day of _____
the within Notice of Violation was forwarded to:

Dominion Energy Manchester Street, Inc.
c/o CT Corporation System
10 Dorrance Street, Suite 530
Providence, RI 02903

by Certified Mail.



ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY SUMMARY

Program: OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE AND INSPECTION, AIR

File No.: AIR 13 – 06

Respondent: Dominion Energy Manchester Street, Inc.

GRAVITY OF VIOLATION					
SEE ATTACHED "PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEETS."					
VIOLATION No. & CITATION	APPLICATION OF MATRIX		PENALTY CALCULATION		AMOUNT
	Type	Deviation	Penalty from Matrix	Number or Duration of Violations	
C (1) – Failure to comply with a NO _x emission rate as required by permit	Type (\$ 10,000 Max. Penalty)*	Minor	\$ 1,000	1 violation	\$1,000.00
SUB-TOTAL					\$1,000.00

*Maximum Penalties represent the maximum penalty amounts per day, per violation.

ECONOMIC BENEFIT FROM NONCOMPLIANCE
<p>COSTS OF COMPLIANCE, EQUIPMENT, O&M, STUDIES OR OTHER DELAYED OR AVOIDED COSTS, INCLUDING INTEREST AND/OR ANY COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE DERIVED OVER ENTITIES THAT ARE IN COMPLIANCE. NOTE: ECONOMIC BENEFIT MUST BE INCLUDED IN THE PENALTY UNLESS:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - THERE IS NO IDENTIFIABLE BENEFIT FROM NONCOMPLIANCE; OR - THE AMOUNT OF ECONOMIC BENEFIT CAN NOT BE QUANTIFIED.
<p>A review of the record in this matter has revealed that the Respondent has either enjoyed no identifiable benefit from the noncompliance alleged in this enforcement action or that the amount of economic benefit that may have resulted can not be quantified.</p>

COST RECOVERY
<p>ADDITIONAL OR EXTRAORDINARY COSTS INCURRED BY THE DIRECTOR DURING THE INVESTIGATION, ENFORCEMENT AND RESOLUTION OF AN ENFORCEMENT ACTION (EXCLUDING NON-OVERTIME PERSONNEL COSTS), FOR WHICH THE STATE IS NOT OTHERWISE REIMBURSED.</p>
<p>A review of the record in this matter has revealed that the DEM has not incurred any additional or extraordinary costs during the investigation, enforcement and resolution of this enforcement action (excluding non-overtime personnel costs), for which the State is not otherwise reimbursed.</p>

TOTAL PENALTY PROPOSED UNDER PENALTY REGULATIONS = \$ 1,000.00

PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEET

CITATION: Failure to comply with a NO_x emission rate as required by permit

VIOLATION NO.: C (1)

TYPE		
<p><u> X </u> TYPE I <u>DIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>	<p><u> </u> TYPE II <u>INDIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>	<p><u> </u> TYPE III <u>INCIDENTAL</u> to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p>
DEVIATION FROM THE STANDARD		
<small>THE DEGREE TO WHICH A PARTICULAR VIOLATION IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT VIOLATED.</small>		
<p><u>FACTORS CONSIDERED:</u></p> <p>Taken from Section 10 (a) (2) of the DEM <i>Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties</i></p> <p>(A) The extent to which the act or failure to act was out of compliance: The Respondent failed to meet the 300 lb NO_x/hour emission limit during a hot start of a combustion turbine as required by its permit. The Respondent is a stationary source of air pollutants subject to federal and state air pollution control regulations. Compliance with emissions limitations of the permit is of essential importance to the regulatory program.</p> <p>(B) Environmental conditions: Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(C) Amount of the pollutant: The permit requires an emission rate of 300 lb NO_x/hour. Respondent's continuous emission monitoring system indicated an emissions rate of 398.6 lb NO_x/hour, an exceedance of more than 30% above the requirement.</p> <p>(D) Toxicity or nature of the pollutant: Nitrogen oxides (NO_x), gases that form when fossil fuel is burned at high temperatures, contribute to acid rain, to eutrophication in coastal waters, and to the formation of ozone in ambient air.</p> <p>(E) Duration of the violation: One hour on 23 January 2013.</p> <p>(F) Areal extent of the violation: Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.</p>		
(continued)		

(continued from the previous page)

- (G) **Whether the person took reasonable and appropriate steps to prevent and/or mitigate the noncompliance:** The Respondent mitigated the violation by increasing its ammonia spray to minimize emissions. After trying that, Respondent decided to abort the startup and safely take the turbine off line. DEM received Respondent's written Excess Emission Report Form on 30 January 2013.
- (H) **Whether the person has previously failed to comply with any regulations, order, statute, license, permit or approval issued or adopted by the Department, or any law which the Department has the authority or responsibility to enforce:** Considered, but not utilized for this calculation.
- (I) **The degree of willfulness or negligence, including but not limited to, how much control the violator had over the occurrence of the violation and whether the violation was foreseeable:** The Respondent had complete control over the violation since the Respondent is the operator of the facility. However, negligence is not alleged.
- (J) **Any other factor(s) that may be relevant in determining the amount of a penalty:** The Respondent self-disclosed to DEM its response to the malfunction, probable cause of the excess emissions, steps taken to minimize emissions during the deviation, and corrective actions/preventative measures taken.

MAJOR	MODERATE	<u> X </u> MINOR
--------------	-----------------	---------------------------

Penalty Matrix where the applicable statute provides for a civil penalty up to \$ 10,000		TYPE I	TYPE II	TYPE III
DEVIATION FROM STANDARD	MAJOR	\$5,000 to \$10,000	\$2,500 to \$5,000	\$1,000 to \$2,500
	MODERATE	\$2,500 to \$5,000	\$1,000 to \$2,500	\$500 to \$1,000
	MINOR	\$1,000 to \$2,500 \$1,000	\$500 to \$1,000	\$100 to \$500