

**STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT**

OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE & INSPECTION

IN RE: Rhode Island College

FILE NO.: AIR 11 – 17

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

A. Introduction

Pursuant to Sections 42-17.1-2(21) and 42-17.6-3 of the Rhode Island General Laws, as amended, (“R.I. Gen. Laws”) you are hereby notified that the Director of the Department of Environmental Management (the “Director” of “DEM”) has reasonable grounds to believe that the above-named party (“Respondent”) has violated certain statutes and/or administrative regulations under DEM's jurisdiction.

B. Administrative History

On or about February 5, 2009 the DEM issued a written notice to the Respondent for the violations that involve several of the emergency generators that are the subject of this notice. The notice required specific actions to correct the violations. Inspections by DEM in February and March 2011 revealed that the Respondent failed to comply with the notice and installed additional generators without obtaining a required permit from the DEM. The Respondent self-reported to the DEM the violations involving Donovan Dining Center and Sweet Hall.

C. Facts

- (1) The facility is located at 600 Mount Pleasant Avenue in the city of Providence, Rhode Island (the “Facility”) and is operated by the Respondent.
- (2) The Facility is (and has been) subject to DEM’s Air Pollution Control (“APC”) Regulations, including but not limited to APC Regulation No. 9, entitled “Air Pollution Control Permits”.
- (3) In April 2011 the Respondent submitted to the DEM minor source permit applications for emergency generators at the Facility. The applications included the following information:
 - (a) A diesel fired emergency engine/generator set with a heat input capacity of 10.5 million British Thermal Units per hour (“BTU/hr”) was installed at New Residence Hall in August 2007.
 - (b) A diesel fired 422 horsepower (“HP”) emergency engine/generator set at Clark Science Lab was installed in March 2010.

- (c) A diesel fired 197 HP emergency engine/generator set at Gaige Hall Data Center was installed in March 2008.
- (d) A diesel fired 490 HP emergency engine/generator set was installed at Fogarty Life Science Classroom in January 2010.
- (e) A diesel fired 158 HP emergency engine/generator set was installed at Building 1 in August 2008.
- (f) A diesel fired 93 HP emergency engine/generator set was installed at Building 7 in the summer of 2008.
- (g) A diesel fired 546 HP emergency engine/generator set was installed at Donovan Dining Center on 1 November 2010.
- (h) A diesel fired 480 HP emergency engine/generator set was installed at Sweet Hall in March 2011.

D. Violation

Based on the foregoing facts, the Director has reasonable grounds to believe that you have violated the following statutes and/or regulations:

- (1) **DEM's APC Regulation 9.2.1(a)** – prohibiting the installation of any stationary source without obtaining a minor source permit from DEM for each installation described in DEM's APC Regulation 9.3.1.
- (2) **DEM's APC Regulation 9.3.1(a)** – requiring a minor source permit for any fuel burning device designed to burn liquid fuels, other than residual oil, having a heat input capacity of five million BTU/hr or greater.
- (3) **DEM's APC Regulation 9.3.1(b)** – requiring a minor source permit for any emergency generator with an internal combustion engine of 50 HP or larger; and, the date of initial startup is on or after November 15, 2007.

E. Penalty

- (1) Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.6-2, the following administrative penalty, as more specifically described in the attached penalty summary and worksheets, is hereby ASSESSED, jointly and severally, against each named respondent:

Seventeen Thousand Dollars (\$17,000.00)

- (2) The proposed administrative penalty is calculated pursuant to the DEM Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties, as amended, and must be paid to the DEM within twenty (20) days of your receipt of this NOV. Payment shall be in the form of a check made payable to the "General Treasury - Water &

Air Protection Program Account,” and shall be forwarded to the DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection, 235 Promenade Street, Suite 220, Providence, Rhode Island 02908-5767.

- (3) Penalties assessed against Respondent in this NOV are penalties payable to and for the benefit of the State of Rhode Island and are not compensation for actual pecuniary loss.

F. Right to Administrative Hearing

- (1) Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws Chapters 42-17.1, 42-17.6, 42-17.7 and 42-35, each named respondent is entitled to request a hearing before the DEM Administrative Adjudication Division regarding the allegations, orders and/or penalties set forth in Sections B through E above. All requests for hearing MUST:

- (a) Be in writing. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and 42-17.6-4(b);
- (b) Be **RECEIVED** by DEM's Administrative Adjudication Division, at the following address, within twenty (20) days of your receipt of this NOV. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and 42-17.7-9:

Administrative Clerk
DEM - Administrative Adjudication Division
One Capitol Hill, 2nd Floor
Providence, RI 02903

- (c) Indicate whether you deny the alleged violations and/or whether you believe that the administrative penalty is excessive. See R.I. Gen. Laws Section 42-17.6-4(b); **AND**
 - (d) State clearly and concisely the specific issues which are in dispute, the facts in support thereof and the relief sought or involved, if any. See Rule 7.00(b) of the DEM Administrative Rules of Practice and Procedure for the Administrative Adjudication Division of Environmental Matters.
- (2) A copy of each request for hearing must also be forwarded to:

Joseph J. LoBianco, Esquire
DEM - Office of Legal Services
235 Promenade Street, 4TH Floor
Providence, RI 02908-5767

- (3) Each named respondent has the right to be represented by legal counsel at all administrative proceedings relating to this matter.
- (4) Each respondent must file a separate and timely request for an administrative hearing before DEM's Administrative Adjudication Division as to each violation

alleged in the written NOV. If any respondent fails to request a hearing in the above-described time or manner with regard to any violation set forth herein, then this NOV shall automatically become a Final Compliance Order enforceable in Superior Court as to that respondent and/or violation and any associated administrative penalty proposed in the NOV shall be final as to that respondent. See R.I. Gen. Laws Sections 42-17.1-2(21)(i) and (v) and 42-17.6-4(b) and (c).

- (5) Failure to comply with this NOV may subject each respondent to additional civil and/or criminal penalties.
- (6) This NOV does not preclude the Director from taking any additional enforcement action nor does it preclude any other local, state, or federal governmental entities from initiating enforcement actions based on the acts or omissions described herein.

If you have any legal questions, you may contact (or if you are represented by an attorney, please have your attorney contact) Joseph J. LoBianco, Esquire, at the DEM Office of Legal Services at (401) 222-6607. All other inquiries should be directed to Martha Mulcahey of DEM's Office of Compliance and Inspection at (401) 222-1360 ext. 7032.

Please be advised that any such inquiries do not postpone, eliminate, or otherwise extend the need for a timely submittal of a written request for a hearing, as described in Section F above.

FOR THE DIRECTOR

David E. Chopy, Chief
DEM Office of Compliance and Inspection

Date: _____

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that on the _____ day of _____
the within Notice of Violation was forwarded to:

Nancy Carriuolo, President
Rhode Island College
600 Mount Pleasant Avenue
Providence, RI 02908

by Certified Mail.



ADMINISTRATIVE PENALTY SUMMARY

Program: OFFICE OF COMPLIANCE AND INSPECTION, AIR

File No.: AIR 11 – 17

Respondent: Rhode Island College

| GRAVITY OF VIOLATION | | | | | |
|---|--|-----------|---------------------|----------------------------------|-------------|
| SEE ATTACHED "PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEETS." | | | | | |
| VIOLATION No. & CITATION | APPLICATION OF MATRIX | | PENALTY CALCULATION | | AMOUNT |
| | Type | Deviation | Penalty from Matrix | Number or Duration of Violations | |
| D (1) and D (2) – Failure to obtain a permit – emergency generator at New Residence Hall | Type I (\$ <u>10,000</u> Max. Penalty)* | Moderate | \$ 2,500 | 1 violation | \$2,500.00 |
| D (1) and D (3) – Failure to obtain a permit – emergency generators at Clark Science Lab, Gaige Hall, Fogarty Life Science, Building #1, and Building #7 | Type I (\$ <u>10,000</u> Max. Penalty)* | Moderate | \$ 2,500 | 5 violations | \$12,500.00 |
| D (1) and D (3) – Failure to obtain a permit – emergency generators at Donovan Dining Center and Sweet Hall | Type I (\$ <u>10,000</u> Max. Penalty)* | Minor | \$ 1,000 | 2 violations | \$2,000.00 |
| SUB-TOTAL | | | | | \$17,000.00 |

*Maximum Penalties represent the maximum penalty amounts per day, per violation.

TOTAL PENALTY PROPOSED UNDER PENALTY REGULATIONS = \$ 17,000.00

PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEET

CITATION: Failure to obtain a permit – emergency generator at New Residence Hall
 VIOLATION NO.: D (1) and (2)

| TYPE | | |
|---|--|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><u> X </u> TYPE I</p> <p><u>DIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">_____ TYPE II</p> <p><u>INDIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">_____ TYPE III</p> <p><u>INCIDENTAL</u> to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> |
| DEVIATION FROM THE STANDARD | | |
| THE DEGREE TO WHICH A PARTICULAR VIOLATION IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT VIOLATED. | | |
| <p><u>FACTORS CONSIDERED:</u></p> <p>Taken from Section 10 (a) (2) of the DEM <i>Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties</i></p> <p>(A) The extent to which the act or failure to act was out of compliance: Respondent failed to apply for and obtain a minor source permit from DEM prior to its installation of an emergency generator subject to State air pollution control regulations. Compliance with permitting and operating requirements is of major importance to the regulatory program.</p> <p>(B) Environmental conditions: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(C) Amount of the pollutant: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(D) Toxicity or nature of the pollutant: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(E) Duration of the violation: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(F) Areal extent of the violation: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p style="text-align: right; margin-top: 20px;">(continued)</p> | | |

(continued from the previous page)

- (G) **Whether the person took reasonable and appropriate steps to prevent and/or mitigate the noncompliance:** The Respondent submitted a minor source permit application to the DEM for the generator in April 2011. A revised application was submitted to the DEM in September 2011.
- (H) **Whether the person has previously failed to comply with any regulations, order, statute, license, permit or approval issued or adopted by the Department, or any law which the Department has the authority or responsibility to enforce:** Not utilized for this calculation.
- (I) **The degree of willfulness or negligence, including but not limited to, how much control the violator had over the occurrence of the violation and whether the violation was foreseeable:** The threshold for permit applicability in the subject regulation has been long-standing and as such, the violation was foreseeable by the Respondent.
- (J) **Any other factor(s) that may be relevant in determining the amount of a penalty:** The violation was discovered by the DEM during inspections in February and March 2011.

| | | |
|--------------|--------------------------|--------------|
| MAJOR | <u>X</u> MODERATE | MINOR |
|--------------|--------------------------|--------------|

| Penalty Matrix where the applicable statute provides for a civil penalty up to \$ 10,000 | | TYPE I | TYPE II | TYPE III |
|--|------------------------|---|--------------------|--------------------|
| DEVIATION FROM STANDARD | MAJOR | \$5,000 to \$10,000 | \$2,500 to \$5,000 | \$1,000 to \$2,500 |
| | <i>MODERATE</i> | \$2,500 to \$5,000 <i>\$2,500</i> | \$1,000 to \$2,500 | \$500 to \$1,000 |
| | MINOR | \$1,000 to \$2,500 | \$500 to \$1,000 | \$100 to \$500 |

PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEET

CITATION: Failure to obtain a permit – emergency generators at Clark Science Lab, Gaige Hall, Fogarty Life Science, Building #1, and Building #7

VIOLATION NO.: D (1) and (3)

| TYPE | | |
|--|--|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><u> X </u> TYPE I</p> <p><u>DIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">_____TYPE II</p> <p><u>INDIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">_____TYPE III</p> <p><u>INCIDENTAL</u> to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> |
| DEVIATION FROM THE STANDARD | | |
| THE DEGREE TO WHICH A PARTICULAR VIOLATION IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT VIOLATED. | | |
| <p><u>FACTORS CONSIDERED:</u></p> <p>Taken from Section 10 (a) (2) of the DEM <i>Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties</i></p> <p>(A) The extent to which the act or failure to act was out of compliance: Respondent failed to apply for and obtain minor source permits from DEM prior to its installation of emergency generators subject to State air pollution control regulations. Compliance with permitting and operating requirements is of major importance to the regulatory program.</p> <p>(B) Environmental conditions: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(C) Amount of the pollutant: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(D) Toxicity or nature of the pollutant: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(E) Duration of the violation: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(F) Areal extent of the violation: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p style="text-align: right; margin-top: 20px;">(continued)</p> | | |

(continued from the previous page)

- (G) **Whether the person took reasonable and appropriate steps to prevent and/or mitigate the noncompliance:** The Respondent submitted minor source permit applications to the DEM for the generators in April 2011. Revised applications were submitted to the DEM in September 2011 and October 2011.
- (H) **Whether the person has previously failed to comply with any regulations, order, statute, license, permit or approval issued or adopted by the Department, or any law which the Department has the authority or responsibility to enforce:** Not utilized for this calculation.
- (I) **The degree of willfulness or negligence, including but not limited to, how much control the violator had over the occurrence of the violation and whether the violation was foreseeable:** The threshold for permit applicability in the subject regulation has been long-standing and as such, the violation was foreseeable by the Respondent.
- (J) **Any other factor(s) that may be relevant in determining the amount of a penalty:** The violations were discovered by the DEM during inspections in February and March 2011.

| | | |
|-------|-----------------------|-------|
| MAJOR | <u> X </u> MODERATE | MINOR |
|-------|-----------------------|-------|

| Penalty Matrix where the applicable statute provides for a civil penalty up to \$ 10,000 | | TYPE I | TYPE II | TYPE III |
|--|-----------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| DEVIATION FROM STANDARD | MAJOR | \$5,000 to \$10,000 | \$2,500 to \$5,000 | \$1,000 to \$2,500 |
| | MODERATE | \$2,500 to \$5,000 \$2,500 | \$1,000 to \$2,500 | \$500 to \$1,000 |
| | MINOR | \$1,000 to \$2,500 | \$500 to \$1,000 | \$100 to \$500 |

PENALTY MATRIX WORKSHEET

CITATION: Failure to obtain a permit – emergency generators at Donovan Dining Center and Sweet Hall

VIOLATION NO.: D (1) and (3)

| TYPE | | |
|--|--|---|
| <p><u> X </u> TYPE I <u>DIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> | <p><u> </u> TYPE II <u>INDIRECTLY</u> related to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> | <p><u> </u> TYPE III <u>INCIDENTAL</u> to protecting health, safety, welfare or environment.</p> |
| DEVIATION FROM THE STANDARD <small>THE DEGREE TO WHICH A PARTICULAR VIOLATION IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE WITH THE REQUIREMENT VIOLATED.</small> | | |
| <p><u>FACTORS CONSIDERED:</u></p> <p>Taken from Section 10 (a) (2) of the DEM <i>Rules and Regulations for Assessment of Administrative Penalties</i></p> <p>(A) The extent to which the act or failure to act was out of compliance: Respondent failed to apply for and obtain minor source permits from DEM prior to its installation of emergency generators subject to State air pollution control regulations. Compliance with permitting and operating requirements is of major importance to the regulatory program.</p> <p>(B) Environmental conditions: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(C) Amount of the pollutant: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(D) Toxicity or nature of the pollutant: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(E) Duration of the violation: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p>(F) Areal extent of the violation: Not utilized for this calculation.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">(continued)</p> | | |

(continued from the previous page)

- (G) **Whether the person took reasonable and appropriate steps to prevent and/or mitigate the noncompliance:** The Respondent submitted minor source permit applications to the DEM for the generators in April 2011. A revised permit application was submitted in September 2011 for Donovan Dining Center.
- (H) **Whether the person has previously failed to comply with any regulations, order, statute, license, permit or approval issued or adopted by the Department, or any law which the Department has the authority or responsibility to enforce:** Not utilized for this calculation.
- (I) **The degree of willfulness or negligence, including but not limited to, how much control the violator had over the occurrence of the violation and whether the violation was foreseeable:** The threshold for permit applicability in the subject regulation has been long-standing and as such, the violation was foreseeable by the Respondent.
- (J) **Any other factor(s) that may be relevant in determining the amount of a penalty:** The violations were self reported by the Respondent.

| | | |
|--------------|-----------------|------------------------------|
| MAJOR | MODERATE | <u>X</u> MINOR |
|--------------|-----------------|------------------------------|

| Penalty Matrix where the applicable statute provides for a civil penalty up to \$ 10,000 | | TYPE I | TYPE II | TYPE III |
|--|--------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| DEVIATION FROM STANDARD | MAJOR | \$5,000 to \$10,000 | \$2,500 to \$5,000 | \$1,000 to \$2,500 |
| | MODERATE | \$2,500 to \$5,000 | \$1,000 to \$2,500 | \$500 to \$1,000 |
| | MINOR | \$1,000 to \$2,500 \$1,000 | \$500 to \$1,000 | \$100 to \$500 |